DISCUSSION ON PAPER 14

DR. PARKER-RHODES felt that the example on p. 202 (of the paper) shows a mix-up between lexical and syntactic points. A better translation would be effected if СРЕДНЮЮ is translated by "averaged" and the whole phrase put after the noun, as first suggested (on p.201). This is an extension of the rule in English that where one noun qualifies another, the qualified stands first. In this instance, "average" is considered in its nominal role and really has nothing to do with quantity. In general, one can get away with a limited set of sentence forms if the lexical forms to fit into them are carefully chosen. But if you have a limited dictionary of lexical forms then you must have a wider choice of output structures to make the lexical forms look right. Whichever is more economical will be preferable.

MR. FOUST agreed to this preferred translation for his example. His suggestion was only a partial solution in which the noun complement phrase is turned into an adjective, which can take a position before the noun. But this was not a general solution.

DR. GOOD asked if machine translation workers had considered inventing slightly modified English (or other languages) that could be easily learned and was easy to automatically translate into.

MR. FOUST said he had considered putting in non-English information in an English output e.g. noun gender information, to help the tying of relative clauses to nouns.

MR. WENGER felt that surely everybody who had produced machine translation output considered that they had produced the modified language that Dr. Good was asking about.

DR. LYONS. Indiana University are trying to produce just such a language. They are aiming at replacing English by a modified English having limited vocabulary and a limited number of constructions. This language would have less redundancy and would be more amenable in machine translation and information retrieval studies.

M. DELAVENAY. In France they are trying to develop a modified French for output purposes, by classifying phrases which have almost the same meaning, and using the most frequent and grammatically most simple as representative of its class.

DR. DOSTERT stated that Prof. S.C. Dodd of Washington University, at the MIT Conference in 1952 first suggested a modified English output.

J. McDaniel